Impacts and opportunities: Results from a discussion of the Fair Food Access Campaign’s work in the Lincoln Park Neighborhood of Duluth

In 2013, the Zeppa Family Foundation received funding from the Center for Prevention at Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Minnesota through the Health Equity in Prevention (HEiP) initiative. Through their Fair Food Access Campaign, they are using multiple strategies to improve food access in the Lincoln Park neighborhood of Duluth, including: increasing community and home gardens, building or attracting a small grocery store, establishing a farmer’s market and/or farm stands, creating an affordable shuttle service to food retailers outside of the neighborhood, and offering nutrition and cooking classes in neighborhood programming.

In November 2014, a group of 15 project stakeholders were invited to a Ripple Effect Mapping discussion about the Fair Food Access Campaign’s (“the Campaign”) impact in the community. The discussion participants included representatives from the Campaign’s main partner organizations, which include the Healthy Duluth Area Coalition, Churches United in Ministry (CHUM), Community Action Duluth, and the Duluth Local Initiatives Support Corporation (LISC). There were also participants from the Zeppa Foundation, the City of Duluth, the University of Minnesota Duluth, the University of Minnesota Extension, local farmers, and residents from the Lincoln Park Neighborhood.

The discussion was intended to not only provide the participants a chance to consider how successful the Campaign has been in achieving its intended goals, but also to identify the indirect or unexpected impacts of the Campaign.

PROJECT IMPACTS

During the discussion, all participants had opportunities to describe the Campaign’s achievements and to discuss the indirect impacts of their work. The participants grouped each of these observed impacts into seven main types of changes that had taken place as a result of the Campaign: supporting environmental changes; advancing systems level change; working differently with the community; contributing to greater availability of and demand for healthy food; promoting new community connections; fostering increased attachment to the community and neighborhood; and generating new knowledge and awareness. Participants were not asked to rank the relative importance of these impacts in relationship to one another. However, the graphic included in this summary does show how many times the participants identified a change in each key area and offers a few examples of key impacts identified by the participants. A summary of the discussion related to each area of change is included in this report, and the specific impacts identified by the participants during the mind mapping exercise are listed in the appendix.

What is Ripple Effect Mapping?

Ripple Effect Mapping (REM) is an evaluation tool used to better understand the intended and unintended impacts of a project. It is particularly helpful when evaluating complex initiatives that both influence, and are impacted by, the community. REM is a facilitated discussion with project staff and local stakeholders that creates a visual “mind map” during the discussion that shows the linkages between program activities and resulting changes in the community.

This approach is intended to help demonstrate the project’s impacts more holistically and to describe the degree to which different types of impacts are observed by project staff and community stakeholders.
Ripple Effects Mapping: Zeppa Foundation

The Fair Food Access Campaign

- **GENERATING NEW KNOWLEDGE AND AWARENESS**
  - Those outside of Lincoln Park gained new knowledge and awareness about the Campaign
  - Local residents gained new knowledge and awareness about food issues

- **FOSTERING INCREASED ATTACHMENT TO THE COMMUNITY AND NEIGHBORHOOD**
  - A stronger sense of community engagement and ownership
  - More opportunities for involvement in the community

- **PROMOTING NEW COMMUNITY CONNECTIONS**
  - Created connections among individuals
  - Created connections among organizations and vendors

- **CONTRIBUTING TO GREATER AVAILABILITY OF AND DEMAND FOR HEALTHY FOOD**
  - Help people access food
  - Established school and community gardens
  - Created a demand for local food and knowledge

- **SUPPORTING ENVIRONMENTAL CHANGES**
  - Helped with local beautification through creation of the Emerald Garden
  - City of Duluth donated land for the Emerald Garden

- **ADVANCING SYSTEMS LEVEL CHANGE**
  - Influenced the Community Development Block Grant program’s interest in addressing food issues
  - City of Duluth is approaching food and land use in a different way
  - Campaign is a model for other organizations and communities

- **WORKING DIFFERENTLY WITH THE COMMUNITY**
  - Changed the metrics for measuring the output of community gardens
  - Employed local community members
  - The Campaign is an organization of organizations
Supporting environmental changes

Participants noted some key changes that have occurred to the physical, urban environment. The Campaign supported the creation of the Emerald Garden, a community garden serving the residents of the Lincoln Park neighborhood. The garden not only allowed residents to grow and access local food, but also helped beautify a vacant piece of land and gave it purpose, which helped to connect the neighborhood. A participant shared that the City of Duluth was also integral in shaping the development of the Emerald Garden by donating the land.

If the Emerald Garden had not been created, there would have been a weedy, vacant space.

Advancing systems level change

Participants pointed out how the Campaign is influencing the way organizations and local government approach local food. The Campaign’s research and advocacy around food access issues helped the Community Development Block Grant (CDBG) program become more interested in addressing food issues. A participant highlighted how CDBG funds are now available to support projects or programs addressing food access issues. In addition, participants shared that the City of Duluth is increasingly supporting local food production by offering key resources (e.g., water, mulch, and compost delivery) to help grow food, and is reviewing how it can foster local food through the development of land and property. Several participants indicated that the Campaign is a model for other communities or organizations to follow. For example, the Arrowhead Regional Development Corporation is looking to borrow parts of the Campaign to help guide its food access work in rural counties, such as New London and Red Lake.

The City of Duluth is approaching food and land use in a different way.
The Fair Food Access Campaign is a unique model that works with schools, communities, and other organizations. They all came together to engage in the work.

Working differently in the community

Throughout the discussion, participants shared examples of how the Campaign worked differently with the community. The Campaign offered some Lincoln Park residents a full scholarship to attend the Fair Food Access Summit, a key networking and educational opportunity focused on how people from around the state have addressed food access issues. To reduce participation barriers and build new knowledge among residents, the Campaign brought key events to the Lincoln Park neighborhood, such as Duluth Community Garden events and programs. In addition, the Campaign helped some of its partner organizations establish stronger connections to the community. For example, Seeds for Success (an urban agriculture program for unemployed Duluth residents) hired a local resident from the Lincoln Park Neighborhood after working with the Campaign. The Campaign also worked with Seeds for Success to change its approach to measuring the output of its gardens by focusing on the wholesale value of its produce rather than the poundage.

The Fair Food Access Campaign is an organization of organizations. It...helps organize the community. People may not work through the Fair Food Access Campaign, but they are informed by its work.
Contributing to greater availability of and demand for healthy food

There were a number of examples of how the Campaign helped increase the availability of and demand for healthy food. Participants shared that Seeds for Success, a key partner of the Campaign, has engaged residents in growing food locally. Seeds for Success and the Campaign also helped launch the Lincoln Park farmers market, which connected residents to fresh food. A participant noted that several older adults rely on the market for fresh food because it is difficult for them to access transportation to local stores. Participants also shared that there has been an increase in the number of gardens at schools and in the community. A major achievement of the Campaign was the creation of the Emerald Garden in the Lincoln Park neighborhood. A participant noted that residents from other parts of Duluth want to incorporate elements of the Campaign into their neighborhoods, such as farmers markets, community gardens, or small-scale cooperative grocers.

Lincoln Park neighborhood residents are so appreciative of the farmers market, more than in other neighborhoods. The neighborhood feels like home.

Promoting new community connections

Participants highlighted how the Campaign helped to establish connections between individuals and organizations. Through the Lincoln Park farmers market, various vendors connected with one another and the local residents. A participant shared that he found that staff at the market are very hard working and welcoming to local vendors and farmers. He also noted that the market allows vendors to sell their produce for lower prices, which helps them compete with large grocery stores. The Campaign also partnered with Insure Duluth to help people sign up for health insurance. A participant pointed out that the partnership was very successful and may occur again next year.

The Fair Food Access Campaign is the most powerful piece of my work because it brings people together in authentic ways, breaks down barriers between agency-specific projects, and makes us feel like part of the team. It's inspirational.

Fostering increased attachment to the community and neighborhood

Several participants shared examples of how the Campaign has generated a stronger sense of community within the Lincoln Park neighborhood. More residents are becoming civically engaged by informing the Lincoln Park small area plan and working with the Duluth Transit Authority. In addition, participants highlighted how residents have new ways to become involved in the neighborhood through the Campaign’s canvassing and the community gardens. A participant noted that the Lincoln Park farmers market and the Emerald Garden have helped build stronger relationships among community members because they offer ongoing experiences and opportunities. Residents also took ownership over addressing local issues regarding access to healthy food. For example, Kwik Trip wanted to establish a store in the Lincoln Park neighborhood, and a group of residents approached the Kwik Trip management asking them to provide healthy food at the store. Kwik Trip agreed that healthy food would be offered in the store, and, as a result, residents helped support zoning variances to bring the store to the neighborhood.

For years and years we were looking for someone to come in and save the neighborhood. Now that has changed. We are taking things into our own hands. We want to make sure people have access to healthy foods.

As a community member of Duluth, to see [the work of the Fair Food Access Campaign in] Lincoln Park is huge. It’s about the community. It’s [about] people’s voices and that is powerful.
Generating new knowledge and awareness

Participants shared many examples of how the Campaign has created new knowledge and awareness around food insecurity and growing/accessing healthy food. Participants pointed out that more residents of the Lincoln Park neighborhood are interested in gardening, healthy eating, and learning how to purchase fresh food within a budget, along with how to cook and preserve it. Some participants also noted that residents are paying closer attention to the source of their food and that the Campaign is working to educate youth about how to grow food through the Emerald Garden. The Campaign has also engaged people beyond the Lincoln Park neighborhood through presenting its work to the University of Minnesota Extension, the Minnesota division of the American Planners Association, and Minnesota community foundations. Different groups and organizations are also adopting the growing practice used by the Lincoln Park Emerald Garden.

FOOD FOR THOUGHT

Some of the challenges identified during the discussion related to the regulation difficulties local farmers and vendors face when they sell food at the farmers markets. Similarly, participants referenced that the Duluth Seed Lending Library received notice that it is not in compliance with Minnesota Department of Agriculture seed laws. In addition, a participant noted how it is difficult to identify available spaces for grocery stores or commercial green houses in the Lincoln Park neighborhood. Another participant also shared that while there has been some regional planning around the local food system, the City of Duluth does not have a city-wide food system plan. This was identified as both an opportunity and challenge.

The following questions may be helpful for The Fair Food Access Campaign and its partners to consider as they plan their future work:

- What opportunities, if any, are there for the Campaign to help individuals and organizations comply with or address local and state regulations?
- Are there ways that the Campaign can use its expertise and resources to help support the creation of a city-wide food system plan?
- How could the Campaign continue to advocate for changes to the built environment that support the creation of greenhouses, additional garden spaces, or stores to lead to greater access of fresh food?
APPENDIX: Project impacts identified by discussion participants

**SUPPORTING ENVIRONMENTAL CHANGES**

If the Emerald Garden had not been created, there would have been a weedy, vacant space. The garden helps with local beautification and now the land has a purpose.

The City of Duluth donated the land for the Emerald Garden. The land was managed by the city and owned by the Minnesota Department of Transportation.

**ADVANCING SYSTEMS LEVEL CHANGE**

The Fair Food Access Campaign partners have influenced the Community Development Block Grant (CDBG) program's interest in addressing food issues because of the local awareness they built around food access and their systems work.

- CDBG funds are now being made available to support projects or programs addressing food access issues.
- The Fair Food Access Campaign could be a potential partner to use the CDBG funds in the future.
- The City of Duluth and the Fair Food Access Campaign partners are involved in discussions about using greenhouses to grow food. This could potentially be supported by CDBG funds.

There is a small area plan happening in the Lincoln Park neighborhood. As part of the plan, there is a Health Impact Assessment that includes analysis of food access issues. Representatives from the Fair Food Access Campaign are helping complete the assessment.

The City of Duluth is approaching food and land use in a different way.

- Food is part of the agenda at the city. It’s more of a focus.
- The City of Duluth has allocated resources (e.g., water, mulch, and compost delivery) to partner with the community around growing food. Economic development has been part of highlighting sites for developers in Lincoln Park.
- When talking with developers, city officials highlighted Lincoln Park as a potential area for grocery store developers.
- The City of Duluth is looking at how to incorporate edible trail design and discussing how it can support local food through the development of land and property.

The Fair Food Access Campaign is a model for other organizations and communities.

- The Blue Cross & Blue Shield Center for Prevention is interested in the Fair Food Access Campaign model and the potential for duplication.
- The Arrowhead Regional Development Corporation regional planning division received funds to partner with the State Health Improvement Project to address food access in rural counties (including the communities of New London and Red Lake). They are looking to use the Fair Food Access Campaign as a model to help guide their work.
- The Fair Food Access Campaign is a unique model that works with schools, communities, and other organizations. They all came together to engage in the work. It is an interesting model. It can serve as a model in the future.

**WORKING DIFFERENTLY WITH THE COMMUNITY**

Changing the metrics for measuring the output of community gardens.

- Seeds of Success has changed its metrics. It used to measure poundage and now measures wholesale value.
- The grant to establish the Emerald Garden was through Cities of Service. Through conversations with Cities of Service about how the garden was developed, the organization changed how it measures the impact of gardens from the overall weight of the produce to the market value.

Employing local community members.

- The Duluth Parks and Recreation Department hired at least two people from Seeds of Success.
- Seeds of Success has intentionally employed a person from the neighborhood who is getting more experience with customer service. Previous to the Fair Food Access Campaign, the organization had not given much thought to hiring from the neighborhood.

The Fair Food Access Campaign is an organization of organizations. It engages in systems work and helps organize the community. People may not work through the Fair Food Access Campaign, but they are informed by its work.

- Lincoln Park residents wouldn't have been aware of or able to attend the Fair Food Access Summit without the Fair Food Access Campaign. This was a wonderful networking and educational opportunity about what people around the state have been doing regarding food access. The Campaign offered full scholarships to residents and agency partners.
- The Fair Food Access Campaign is helping to bring citywide events into the Lincoln Park neighborhood (e.g., Duluth Community Garden events) to reduce barriers to participation and build new knowledge.
Helping people access food.

During the summer of 2012, Seeds of Success delivered subsidized, in-season, fresh, local produce to senior high-rise residents. This was a pilot project that help lead to the farmers market.

Programs in Community Action Duluth (CAD) buy food from Seeds for Success, making the local food system more of a closed loop. CAD runs programming in the nights and evening and they hired a local resident to prepare food for the programming.

One hundred pounds of vegetables were given to children and their families through the Haunted Happenings event.

Farmers market

Lincoln Park neighborhood residents are so appreciative of the farmers market, more than in other neighborhoods. “The neighborhood feels like home.” -local farmer

In the Lincoln Park area, there are a lot of older adults who depend on the farmers market because they can't take a cab or bus to the store. They will walk to Lincoln Park and utilize the market every week. This is really great to see.

Seeds of Success has played a big role in the farmers market. It coordinates and recruits vendors, and provides the EBT access and Market Bucks for the other vendors.

Seeds of Success grows produce that is used by local restaurants.

The Fair Food Access Campaign helped the Whole Foods Co-op understand the Lincoln Park neighborhood's needs and helped guide where it should be located.

NEAC (Northern Expressions Arts Collective) provides youth education and services. The organization is adding elements of healthy food access into its programs.

The Fair Food Access Campaign contributed to Second Harvest Food Bank, increasing their involvement in providing fresh and healthy food in the Lincoln Park neighborhood and shared information with Second Harvest about food access needs in the neighborhood.

The Junior League is interested in helping with year round growing and increasing food access through a greenhouse. The League is fundraising to help build a greenhouse.

Establishing school and community gardens.

Almost all the schools have gardens now. These garden plots are being used to grow food.

At the Lincoln Park Middle School, there is a school garden.

Local land being used to grow food.

Residents want to access the plots in the community garden.

Residents planted an orchard with various fruits and a berry patch.

In Spring 2013, the Emerald Garden was built in Lincoln Park. Food was grown for residents and local food shelves.

Creating demand for local food and knowledge.

Residents in other communities want to create something similar to the Fair Food Access Campaign. They want farmers markets, a small-scale grocer/co-op, or just the canvassing assessment in their neighborhoods. This is especially true in the western parts of Duluth, for example the Morgan Park neighborhood.

The Fair Food Access Campaign is open to suggestions to different funding or collaboration that would allow it to replicate its efforts in other communities. Currently it does not have the capacity to do this.

The University of Minnesota, Duluth, did a study to gauge food access in Morgan Park.
## Promoting New Community Connections

### Connections among individuals.

A resident was canvassing the neighborhood and dropping off literature at a house. The person who lived at the house had some mobility issues and was a veteran. The resident was able to make a connection with him.

### Connections among organizations and vendors.

The Fair Food Access Campaign partnered with Insure Duluth to help people get health insurance. The partnership was successful in part because of the local brand name of the Fair Food Access Campaign.

They are considering partnering again.

GnarrFoodz wanted to open a co-op in Lincoln Park because of the food access needs identified by the Fair Food Access Campaign. However, the Whole Foods Co-op was already planning to come into the neighborhood. GnarrFoodz still wanted to help out so it donated four full shares of produce to Seaway/Esmond housing for low-income individuals.

A resident was amazed by the connections made with the people who work in organizations interested in fair food access, or with individuals who are interested and want to know more about it. “Everybody involved is always trying to come up with new solutions. The Fair Food Access Campaign's work is not a passing phase.” – Local resident

“The Fair Food Access Campaign is the most powerful piece of my work because it brings people together in authentic ways, breaks down barriers between agency-specific projects, and makes us feel like part of the team. It's inspirational.” - Local resident

Farmers market vendors are connecting to one another and people in the Lincoln Park neighborhood.

There is the perception that the Lincoln Park market is more welcoming to vendors than other markets in town.

A farmer who sells produce at the Lincoln Park farmers market has made strong connections in the last four years with staff and customers at the market and has found the market to be much more welcoming to vendors. He has found that staff at the market are willing to put in the sweat equity, which is not the case at other farmers markets. The market also allows vendors to sell their produce for lower prices, so they can compete with big chains.

Through a workplace connection a resident volunteered at the Food Safety Program at the Haunted Happenings at Harrison Neighborhood Park.

The Duluth Transit Authority is interested in working with the Fair Food Access Campaign to explore transit-based solutions to food access.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stronger sense of community engagement and ownership.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>While the Fair Food Access Campaign was initially about food, it is also about residents feeling that they didn't have power in their neighborhoods. There is growing ownership and people taking pride in their neighborhood.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“As a community member of Duluth, to see [the work of the Fair Food Access Campaign in] Lincoln Park, it’s huge. It’s about the community. It’s people’s voices and that is powerful.” -Local resident</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There is a group of residents working on taking ownership over trail planning and implementation as it relates to the Lincoln Park small area plan.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A local restaurant that uses food from Seeds for Success is opening up a second restaurant in the Lincoln Park neighborhood small business district.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There was an organized open street event that was heavily supported by the Fair Food Access Campaign.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Two local residents have become more involved in other neighborhood issues, including the Lincoln Park Small Area Plan, the Duluth Transit Authority, and connections to services for seniors.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Community has taken ownership of the issues with residents and volunteers instead of just relying on organizations and agencies.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>&quot;For years and years we were looking for someone to come in and save the neighborhood. Now that has changed. We are taking things into our own hands. We want to make sure people have access to healthy foods.&quot; -Local resident</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Residents are being more proactive rather than reactive to things happening to the community - before Kwik Trip even came into the community, community members contacted them and arranged a meeting to ask them to provide healthy food if they came into the neighborhood. When Kwik Trip agreed that healthy food would be provided, the residents helped support zoning variances to bring a store to the neighborhood. This was a key example of community leadership and engagement.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People from big corporations are listening to residents.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It was stated by the CFO of Kwik Trip that this was the first time the company had been approached by a community asking it to provide healthy food.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>There is increased pride in Lincoln Park. The Fair Food Access Campaign approach is about the community, it is not a top-down approach. It involves people who really care about the neighborhood.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Opportunities for involvement in the community.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A resident moved to the Lincoln Park neighborhood before the Fair Food Access Campaign, but has since become involved in the campaign and the gardens. The resident feels more at home in the community, has met a lot of people, has learned a lot about gardening and noted that it feels fun to be part of the neighborhood.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Fair Food Access Campaign has connected people to the community in a variety of ways.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There are different ways to become involved through canvassing and the community gardens.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A resident shared that the farmers market and the Emerald Garden build community in a long-term way because they offer ongoing experiences and opportunities.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
New knowledge and awareness gained by external individuals (i.e., those who are not Lincoln Park neighborhood residents) about the Fair Food Access Campaign’s work.

At the Fair Food Access Summit the Fair Food Access Campaign shared stories of its work and promising practices with participants. Representative Rick Nolan, the Lieutenant Governor, and other politicians (county commissioners and city council members) learned about the Fair Food Access Campaign model through outreach events and tours.

The Fair Food Access Campaign has done presentations about its work for U of M Extension, the MN division of the American Planners Association, and Minnesota community foundations.

People and organizations are using a different growing practice

| Hügelkultur gardening method was used in the Lincoln Park Emerald Garden and is now being used at an urban farm. |
| The City of Duluth is looking at using Hügelkultur to do some edible trail designs, potentially next spring or summer. |
| Students at Lake Superior College are also using Hügelkultur. |

New knowledge and awareness about food issues gained by local residents.

Growing food

| More Lincoln Park residents are interested in gardening and healthy eating. |
| More information is being shared about growing food. A resident was surprised to discover that you can grow produce in small spaces like buckets. Other residents have become interested in this approach. |

Accessing food

| There is a growing awareness of the lack of food access and increasing acknowledgement that healthy food is an important community issue. |
| Lincoln Park residents know that they can use SNAP (Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Program) at the Whole Foods Co-op. |
| The Fair Food Access Campaign has started to focus on neighborhood canvassing and, as a result, it seems like there are more people talking about fair food access issues. "They just get all jazzed up about it. I think it's pretty cool.‖ -Local organizer |
| For years neighborhood plans talked about the need for a grocery store. Through the Fair Food Access Campaign residents learned that it is about getting access to fresh foods and this can come through a variety of sources, not just a grocery store. |

Cooking and preserving food

| Lincoln Park residents were able to attend community education courses on cooking and preserving food at Harrison or Lincoln Park middle schools. Having these courses located in Lincoln Park helped decrease barriers to participation. |
| Anyone from the Lincoln Park neighborhood who wanted to take a community education course did not have to pay for it. |

Understanding sources of food

| People are paying attention to where their food is coming from and how it is grown. They are asking questions about it. |
| Youth education |
| The Campaign and residents are working with kids from a very early age to understand where their food comes from. |
| Youth around the Emerald Garden engage with and learn from gardeners about growing food. |
| People are starting to wake up that the big corporations will not always be able to provide them with options when it comes to food. |